

Rewriting Children's Rights Judgments

From Academic Vision to New Practice

Edited by
Helen Stalford, Kathryn Hollingsworth
and Stephen Gilmore



• H A R T •
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2017

Hart Publishing
An imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Hart Publishing Ltd
Kemp House
Chawley Park
Cumnor Hill
Oxford OX2 9PH
UK

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc
50 Bedford Square
London
WC1B 3DP
UK

www.hartpub.co.uk
www.bloomsbury.com

Published in North America (US and Canada) by
Hart Publishing
c/o International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213-3786
USA

www.isbs.com

**HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the
Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc**

First published 2017

112764

© The editors and contributors severally 2017

The editors and contributors have asserted their right under the Copyright,
Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Authors of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means,
electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval
system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage
occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be
accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©.

All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©.

This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union, <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2017.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN: HB: 978-1-78225-925-1
ePDF: 978-1-78225-927-5
ePub: 978-1-78225-926-8

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Stalford, Helen, editor. | Hollingsworth, Kathryn, editor. | Gilmore, Stephen, editor.

Title: Rewriting children's rights judgments : from academic vision to new practice /
Edited by Helen Stalford, Kathryn Hollingsworth and Stephen Gilmore.

Description: Portland, Oregon : Hart Publishing, 2017. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017025634 (print) | LCCN 2017027013 (ebook) | ISBN 9781782259268 (Epub) |
ISBN 9781782259251 (hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Children—Legal status, laws, etc.—Great Britain. | Children's rights—Great Britain—Cases.

Classification: LCC KD735 (ebook) | LCC KD735 .R49 2017 (print) | DDC 342.4108/772—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017025634>

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

Printed and bound in Great Britain by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY

To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk. Here you will find extracts,
author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	xvii

Part I: Children's Rights Judgments: From Academic Vision to New Practice

1. <i>Introducing Children's Rights Judgments</i>	3
<i>Helen Stalford, Kathryn Hollingsworth and Stephen Gilmore</i>	
2. <i>Judging Children's Rights: Tendencies, Tensions, Constraints and Opportunities</i>	17
<i>Helen Stalford and Kathryn Hollingsworth</i>	
3. <i>Towards Children's Rights Judgments</i>	53
<i>Kathryn Hollingsworth and Helen Stalford</i>	

Part II: Children's Rights and Family Life

4. <i>Re X and Y (Foreign Surrogacy) [2008] EWHC 3030 (Fam)</i>	89
Commentary: <i>Emma Walmsley</i>	
Judgment: <i>Jo Bridgeman</i>	
5. <i>Case C-167/12 CD v ST [2014] ECR I-000 18 March 2014</i>	105
Commentary: <i>Connie Healy</i>	
Judgment: <i>Eugenia Caracciolo di Torella</i>	
6. <i>Re C v XYZ County Council [2007] EWCA Civ 1206</i>	125
Commentary: <i>Brian Sloan</i>	
Judgment: <i>Claire Fenton-Glynn</i>	
7. <i>Gas and Dubois v France (Application no. 25951/07) ECtHR 15 March 2012</i>	143
Commentary: <i>Ursula Kilkelly</i>	
Judgment: <i>Lydia Bracken</i>	
8. <i>P-S (Children) [2013] EWCA Civ 223</i>	159
Commentary: <i>David Lane</i>	
Judgment: <i>Jane Williams</i>	
9. <i>Hoge Raad ECLI:NL:HR:2014:3535 5 December 2014</i>	173
Commentary: <i>Ton Liefwaard and Marielle Bruning</i>	
Judgment: <i>Ton Liefwaard and Marielle Bruning</i>	

xiv *Table of Contents*

10. *AAA v Associated Newspapers Ltd* [2013] EWCA Civ 554.....193
 Commentary: *Thomas DC Bennett*
 Judgment: *Kirsty Hughes*

Part III: Children's Rights and Medical Decision-making

11. *Re W (A Minor)(Consent to Medical Treatment)* [1993] Fam 64.....213
 Commentary: *Emma Nottingham*
 Judgment: *Stephen Gilmore*
12. *F v F* [2013] EWHC 2683 (Fam).....229
 Commentary: *Julie Doughty*
 Judgment: *Emma Cave*
13. *Re T (A Minor) (Wardship: Medical Treatment)* [1997] 1 FLR 502245
 Commentary: *Noam Peleg*
 Judgment: *Michael Freeman*
14. *Re A (Conjoined Twins)* [2000] EWCA Civ 254.....257
 Commentary: *Jonathan Herring*
 Judgment: *Amel Alghrani*

Part IV: Children's Rights and Public Authorities

15. *R (on the Application of Castle) v Commissioner of Police for the Metropolis*
 [2011] EWHC 2317 (Admin).....275
 Commentary: *Fiona Donson*
 Judgment: *Aoife Daly*
16. *Collins v Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government*
 [2013] EWCA Civ 1865 CA293
 Commentary: *Stephen Cottle*
 Judgment: *Simon Hoffman*
17. *Government of the Republic of South Africa and Others v Grootboom*
 2001 (1) SA 46 (CC), 2000 (11) BCLR 1169 (CC).....311
 Commentary: *Aoife Nolan*
 Judgment: *Anashri Pillay*
18. *Valsamis v Greece* (Application No 21787/93) ECtHR, 18 December 1996.....329
 Commentary: *Jenny Driscoll*
 Judgment: *Laura Lundy*
19. *R (On the Application of Begum) v Head-teacher and Governors*
of Denbigh High School [2006] UKHL 15345
 Commentary: *Nuno Ferreira*
 Judgment: *Maria Federica Moscati*
20. *S v Special Educational Needs and Disability Tribunal (SENDIST)*
and Oxfordshire County Council [2005] EWHC 196 (Admin)363
 Commentary: *Seamus Byrne*
 Judgment: *Neville Harris*

21. *Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and the Law v Canada (Attorney General)* 2004 SCC 4381
 Commentary: *Lucinda Ferguson*
 Judgment: *Sonja Grover*

Part V: Children's Rights and Criminal Justice

22. *Roper v Simmons* 543 US 551 (2005)405
 Commentary: *Emily Buss*
 Judgment: *Barbara Bennett Woodhouse*
23. *R v JTB* [2009] UKHL 20421
 Commentary: *Kathryn Hollingsworth*
 Judgment: *Ray Arthur*
24. *The Prosecutor v Thomas Lubanga Dyilo* International Criminal Court, Trial Chamber I, Case No ICC-01/04-01/06 14 March 2012.....439
 Commentary: *Conrad Nyamutata*
 Judgment: *Trevor Buck*
25. *Farooq Ahmed v Federation of Pakistan* PLD 2005 Lahore 15461
 Commentary: *Urfan Khaliq*
 Judgment: *Abdullah Khoso*
26. *The Case of John Hudson* December 1783, trial of John Hudson (t17831210-19)477
 Commentary: *Sue Farran and Rhona Smith*
 Judgment: *Sue Farran and Rhona Smith*

Part VI: Children's Rights and International Movement

27. *RCB as Litigation Guardian of EKV, CEV, CIV and LRV v The Honourable Justice Colin James Forrest* [2012] HCA 47495
 Commentary: *Rhona Schuz*
 Judgment: *Brian Simpson*
28. *Povse v Austria* (Application no 3890/11) ECtHR 18 June 2013513
 Commentary: *Ruth Lamont*
 Judgment: *Lara Walker*
29. *Case C-34/09 Zambrano v Office national de l'emploi (ONEm)* [2011] ECR I-01177 8 March 2011.....529
 Commentary: *Charlotte O'Brien*
 Judgment: *Helen Stalford*
30. *Antwi and others v Norway* (Application No 26940/10) ECtHR 14 February 2012545
 Commentator: *Ellen Nissen*
 Judgment: *Maria Papaioannou*

xvi *Table of Contents*

31. <i>Defence for Children International (DCI) v Belgium</i> (Complaint No 69/2011) ECSR 23 October 2012	557
Commentator: <i>Gamze Erdem Türkelli</i> Judgment: <i>Wouter Vandenhole</i>	
<i>Index</i>	579